

Minutes of the Meeting of Project Monitoring and Evaluation Group (PMEG) held on 9th January 2012 at Shastri Bhavan, New Delhi

The meeting of the Project Monitoring and Evaluation Group (PMEG) for the scheme of Inclusive Education for the Disabled at Secondary Stage (IEDSS) was held on 09-01-2012 at Shastri Bhavan, New Delhi under the chairpersonship of Secretary (SE&L) to discuss the proposals from the States of Assam, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Manipur, Karnataka, Nagaland, Orissa, Punjab and Sikkim.

Proposals from the States of Karnataka, Punjab and Sikkim could not be discussed since no officers from these States were present. The list of participants is annexed. Approval on the proposal of Manipur has been withheld due to model code of conduct in the State.

2. At the outset, Director (IE) welcomed the members of PM&EG. The proposals received from the State Governments were then discussed. The details of discussions are as follow:

Item No.1 Proposal of Assam.

The proposal under NGO component had been discussed in the meeting of PMEG dated 13-5-2011. The State Government had then been directed to recast the proposal of Dhule Regional Physically Handicapped Dev. Association to cover districts where this NGO had a presence and could execute the programme.

Ms. Mamta Hojai, Deputy Director of Secondary Education, Government of Assam made a presentation, highlights of which are as under:

- 1631 children with disabilities are proposed to be covered by the NGO – Dhule Regional Physically Handicapped Dev. Association.
- Financial assistance of Rs.15.52 crore has been sought

PMEG made the following observations:

- It is proposed to appoint 203 special teachers during 2011-12. However only 43 teachers have been appointed so far. Only 3 teachers are qualified (Diploma holder in Special Education) and it would not be possible for them to look after 1631 children.
- NGO works only in Locomotor disability and not in other disabilities.
- Salary of general teachers is not admissible under the scheme.
- 'In Principle' approval had been given in the previous year also due to unqualified teachers, and there is no point in doing same again for the current year. The State Government should address the issue of non-availability of qualified teachers urgently in a time-bound manner.

Hence PMEG did not recommend the proposal. The State Government was requested to revise the proposal keeping in view the number of qualified teachers and submit within 15 days for reconsideration of PMEG. It was also decided that the proposals for 2011-12 would not be considered in the next financial year.

Item No.II Proposal of Madhya Pradesh.

The proposal in respect of State Government component had already been approved in the meeting of PMEG held on 15-09-2011. Therefore the proposal relating to 2 NGOs was taken up for consideration. Shri Alok Khare, Deputy Director (IEDSS), Madhya Pradesh presented the proposal. He intimated that proposal for 4 NGOs was submitted for consideration. The State representative was informed that proposal for only 2 NGOs had been received in the Ministry and hence would be considered. The State representative was also informed that the proposals are being submitted in piecemeal and that too without proper examination/comments. The State Government was requested to submit the proposals in one lot.

In the proposals of NGOs, coverage of 64 disabled children was proposed and financial assistance for Rs. 7,97,000/- sought.

During the item-wise discussion, as proposed by State Government, State representative informed that Braille books provided by Social Welfare Department are very expensive. The students are being provided Braille sheets and Audio CDs by the NGO. Head, DEGSN, NCERT was of the view that Braille books are necessary for studies and cannot be substituted by other resources. Secretary (SE&L) suggested that NCERT should advise in the matter of making Braille books available in the States.

Since the components 'Assessment' and 'Salary of helpers' have not been recommended by State Governments, these components were not approved by PMEG.

The funds sanctioned under different heads by the PMEG are as under:

- (i) Students Oriented Component : The PMEG recommended an amount of Rs. 1,75,200 under this component for assisting 64 children.
- (ii) Teacher Oriented Component : The PMEG recommended an amount of Rs. 4,86,000 under this component

Details are given at **Annexure-I**

Item No.III Proposal of Maharashtra.

Shri R.K. Shinde, Coordinator (IEDSS), Maharashtra, who was present in the meeting, informed that he could not bring the proposal and as such he is not conversant with the proposal. However during the discussion, he informed that State government has not made provision of Rs. 600/- per disabled child as stipend during the current financial year. He also informed that there are Book Banks in the State and free books are given to SC, ST students and girls. Transport allowance is also given to girls. PMEG was of the view that these provision should have been taken into consideration in the proposal. Since there was no clarity in the proposal and the officer was not able to give details, the PMEG decided not to consider the proposal of Maharashtra. The State Government was given 15 days' time to rework and resubmit the proposal.

State representative was also informed that funds released during 2009-10 under State component have been utilized by the State government on payment of teachers' salary only and not on other items for which the amount was released. In the proposal for 2010-11 submitted by the State Government, it was observed that the State Government had included children of Class VIII, which is not permissible under the IEDSS scheme. State representative informed that 2 subheads had been created by the State Finance Department and funds given only under the salary head. Hence expenditure could be made only for salary. PMEG recommended that a letter should be written to the State Secretary since this would have repercussions on the future releases and expenditure also.

Item No.IV Proposal of Nagaland

Dr. Chuba Imchar, Deputy Director, Government of Nagaland presented the proposal. During the course of discussion, it was observed that none of the teachers appointed by the State Government are qualified as special teachers and only a few have B.Ed. degrees. The State representative informed that there is dearth of qualified teachers in the State despite advertisements. Secretary(SE&L) asked about the reasons for not getting qualified teachers. The State representative informed that there are no institutions to impart training in the State and teachers are sent to other States for obtaining requisite qualifications. Secretary (SE&L) suggested that teachers may be trained through distance learning mode. The State representative confirmed that about 50 teachers would be enrolled in IGNOU by June 2012 for obtaining requisite qualifications. All the teachers would also be enrolled in short duration courses/training. It has also been learnt that Ministry of DONER has sanctioned a project to RCI for training of special

teachers in the States of the North-Eastern region. The State was advised to obtain details from RCI.

PMEG also suggested that officers from NCERT could visit Nagaland to appraise the programme and guide the State.

The funds sanctioned under different heads by the PMEG are as under:

- Salary for Administrative Cell : The PMEG recommended an amount of Rs.8,76,456/-under this component
- Student Oriented Component : The PMEG recommended an amount of Rs. 1,10,85,000/- under this component for 3695 children.
- Teacher Oriented Component : The PMEG recommended an amount of Rs. 9,49,65,200/- under this component.
- Other Component: The PMEG recommended an amount of Rs. 2,49,45,000/- under this component.

Details are given at **Annexure-II**. It was also decided that 1st instalment will be released. However, release of second instalment would be considered after confirmation of details of teachers enrolled for various courses as decided above. State representative was also requested to immediately provide the details of institutions to be strengthened and orientation programme, as proposed.

Item No.V Proposal of Odisha

Shri K.N. Sharma, Deputy Director, Odisha Madhyamik Siksha Mission presented the proposal. Highlights of the proposal are as under:

- 3856 children with disabilities are proposed to be covered.
- The scheme will be implemented through 36 NGOs
- 36 Resource rooms are proposed to be constructed
- Financial assistance of Rs.13.55 crore has been sought

Shri T.D. Dhariyal, Dy. Chief Commissioner of Disabilities asked the State representative about the location of 36 resource room and as to how 36 resource rooms will cater to the needs of 3856 students proposed to be covered. It was advised that gradually resource norms should be built in each school since those at BRCs will be difficult to approach by disabled children.

Ms. Anita Julka, Professor, NCERT observed that most of the NGOs involved in implementation of the scheme are not experts in the field of disabilities. It was also observed that teachers are not qualified, as prescribed. Secretary (SE&L) observed that the State Government is sending proposals of NGOs without examining them properly.

The State Govt. was asked to share with the Ministry the format used to invite applications from NGOs to implement IEDSS so that the eligibility criteria therein could be verified. The State Government should also certify that the concerned NGOs fulfill the eligibility criteria.

The State representative was advised that new resource rooms should not be constructed. One of the existing rooms in the school should be used for setting up a resource room. Equipment may be procured under RMSA, if possible. The State representative was also advised to arrange for teachers to obtain the requisite qualifications, as per the scheme, during this year.

PMEG recommended the amount as under:

(a) State component

- Administrative Cell: Rs. 59,90,886/- for 4 posts only.
- Training of teacher: : Rs. 6,30,000/-
- Orientation of Parents, Principals & Administrators : Rs. 17,60,000/-.
- Construction of 108 ramps : Rs. 7,56,000/-
- Construction of 180 toilets: 9,00,000/-

(b) NGO component (36 component)

- Total amount of the proposal approved was Rs. 11,57,71,720/-

Details are given at **Annexure-III**

In conclusion, PMEG made the following observations:

- State Governments should send at least Director level officers, who are well conversant with the scheme to attend the meeting so that meaningful discussions can take place. A letter may be sent to all the States/UTs in this regard.
- A meeting of PMEG may be convened shortly in the respect of the proposals received in the Ministry, whose representatives have not been able to attend the meetings held so far in 2011-12. Thereafter, no meeting will be held for the proposals for the year 2011-12.
- NCERT may evaluate the implementation of the IEDSS Scheme in all the States/UTs (i) to assess the current influence of the scheme on enrolment, access, retention and achievement of students with disabilities at the secondary stage (ii) to find out whether students covered under this scheme are getting the required resource support in terms of trained teachers, assistive devices, adapted materials and learning aids (iii) to identify good practices of inclusive education in the States at the secondary stage (iv) to identify special needs of girl students with disabilities and of students with disabilities belonging to scheduled castes, scheduled tribes and minorities. PMEG was apprised that the proposal, with an estimated cost of Rs. 31.78 lakh for evaluation of the scheme, received from NCERT was submitted to IFD for concurrence, and the observations of IFD on the proposal have

been conveyed to NCERT for their clarification. NCERT was requested again for an urgent reply so that the work could be started at the earliest, especially as evaluation of existing scheme is required for continuation into the next Plan period.

Name of the participants

1. Smt Anshu Vaish, Secretary (SE&L) Chairperson
2. Smt Radha S. Chauhan, Joint Secretary (SE-I)
3. Dr. Alka Bhargava, Director(IE)
4. Ms. Sunanda Sharma Section Officer(IFD) M/o HRD
5. Shri T.D. Dhariyal, Deputy Chief Commissioner (Disabilities), O/o CCPD
6. Prof. Anita Julka, Head DEGSN, NCERT, Delhi
7. Ms. Pinki Rani, Technical Executive to Chairperson, National Trust
8. Ms. Mamta Hojai, Deputy Director of Secondary Education, Assam
9. Ms Depala Director SCERT, Government of Manipur
10. Ms. K. Surila Coordinator(IEDSS), SCERT Government of Manipur
11. Shri Alok Khare, Deputy Director (IEDSS) Government of Madhya Pradesh
12. Shri Vasudev Kumar Singh, Coordinator (IEDSS) Government of Madhya Pradesh
13. Dr. Chuba Imchan, Deputy Director, Government of Nagaland
14. Shri K.N. Sharma, Deputy Director Odisha Siksha Mission, Government of Odisha
15. Shri R.K. Sinha, Coordinator (IEDSS) Government of Maharashtra
16. Shri Aditya Chamoli, Under Secretary, M/o HRD
17. Shri Jitendra Pratap Singh, Section Officer, M/o HRD

Item : Proposal of Manipur

Proposals of Manipur for the years 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12 were taken up for consideration. Ms. Depala, Director SCERT, Government of Manipur made a presentation, highlights of which are as under:

2009-10

- No proposal was received from the State Government during 2009-10
- 396 children with disabilities were covered with the help of 49 Special teachers
- 150 general teachers were trained.
- Expenditure on assessment of children – Rs. 29,400/- and expenditure on salary of IEDSS Cell – Rs. 56,80,839/-

2010-11

- The proposal for 2010-11 could not be discussed in the meetings of PMEG as no representatives from the State Government attended the meetings.
- 363 children with disabilities were covered with the help of 49 Special teachers
- 85 general teachers were trained.
- expenditure on salary of IEDSS Cell – Rs. 58,17,591/-

2011-12

- 334 children with disabilities are proposed to be covered
- 49 Special teachers and 224 schools are proposed to be covered .
- Financial assistance of Rs.1,08,07,690/- has been sought.

The State representative informed that State government has lowered the payscales scale (which is not correct. In fact pay scales have been upgraded from 01-04-2011) of teachers. Therefore the unspent amount of the years 2007-08 and 2008-09 were used for disbursing salary in the year 2009-10 without seeking revalidation from Govt of India. The officer informed that the Government has fixed the salary for helpers which she was unable to substantiate. She was informed that this would be done by the guardians, parents.

Following observations were made by the PMEG:

- The State Government should submit and get the proposal cleared in the same year so that benefits of the scheme reach in time, since old proposals need to be sent to Ministry of Finance for approval..
- The State Government has proposed to provide assistive devices to all the students being covered, which appears unrealistic. Similarly, books are also being provided to all the students. The proposal for low vision children be reviewed.

- The State Government should do the micro-planning before submitting the proposal to the Government of India.
- Rs. 3000 per child is provided under student-oriented component. Therefore State should prioritise their need within this amount after reassessing the proposal in consultation with medical advice.

The State Government has not submitted any proposal for approval/reimbursement of amount for the years 2009-10 & 2010-11. For 2011-12, Rs 1,00,34,200/- has been approved . Details of the approved amount are at **Annexure**.

disabilities. It was also observed that teachers are not qualified, as prescribed. Secretary (SE&L) observed that the State Government is sending proposals of NGOs without examining them properly.

The State Govt. was asked to send the format being used to invite applications from NGOs to implement IEDSS so that the eligibility criteria could be seen. The State Government should also certify that the NGOs fulfill the eligibility criteria.

The State representative was told that new resource rooms should not be constructed. One of the existing rooms in the school should be used for resource room. Equipments may be procured under RMSA. The State representative was also told that teachers should get requisite qualifications, as per the scheme, during this year.

PMEG recommended the amount as under:

- Administrative Cell: Rs. 62,73,111/- for 4 posts only.
- Training of teacher: : Rs. 6,30,00/-
- Construction of 108 ramps : Rs. 7,56,000/-
- Construction of 180 toilets: 9,00,000/-

Details are given at **Annexure-III**

After discussion on the proposals submitted by the State Governments, PMEG made the following observations:

- State Governments should send at least Director level officers, who are well conversant with the scheme to attend the meeting so that meaningful discussions can take place. A letter may be sent to all the States/UTs in this regard.
- A meeting of PMEG may be convened shortly in the respect of the proposals received in the Ministry, whose representatives have not been able to attend the meetings held so far in 2011-12. Thereafter, no meeting will be held for the proposals for the year 2011-12.
- NCERT may evaluate the implementation of the IEDSS Scheme in all the States/UTs (i) To assess the current influence of the scheme on

enrolment, access, retention and achievement of students with disabilities at the secondary stage (ii) To find out whether students covered under this scheme are getting the required resource support in terms of trained teachers, assistive devices, adapted materials and learning aids (iii) To identify good practices of inclusive education in the States at the secondary stage (iv) To identify special needs of girl students with disabilities and of students with disabilities belonging to scheduled castes, scheduled tribes and minorities.